Challenges in Emergency and Abnormal Checklist Design

Barbara Burian, Ph.D.

San Jose State University Foundation at the NASA Ames Research Center



The Emergency and Abnormal Situations project is funded through the NASA Aviation Safety and Security Program.



Emergency and Abnormal Situations Project Industry Contacts and Consultants

Manufacturers:	Boeing, Bombardier, Airbus Industries, BAe Systems,
Regulatory and Governmental Agencies:	FAA, CAA (UK), JAA, ICAO, Eurocontrol, NavCanada
Unions and Trade Groups:	ALPA, APA, SWAPA, ATA, IATA, AFA, ADF
Accident Investigation Bodies:	NTSB, TSB of Canada, ISASI
Airlines:	Airborne Express, Air Canada, Alaska, Aloha, American, Atlantic Southeast, Cathay Pacific, Continental, Delta, Fed Ex, Frontier, Hawaiian, Horizon, JetBlue, Southwest, United, UPS,
NASA SA Human Factors	US Airways, TWA (prior to merger)





15 Different Categories of Issues – some are related to:

Training

Human Performance under Stress

Automation and Automated Aircraft Systems

Emergency Equipment and Evacuation Issues

Checklists and Procedures





Challenges in Emergency and Abnormal Checklist Design

Smoke, Fire, and Fumes Checklists and Procedures





What Drives (or Should Drive*) the Design and Content?

- Differences in aircraft and equipment design
- Understanding of how different types of fires are ignited, fed, and spread
- Type of operations extended range, passenger vs. cargo
- Assumptions about efficacy of crew response and expectations about amount of time available
- Human factors considerations, Understanding of human performance while under stress *
- History of the air carrier, History within the industry
- Philosophies, company policies, and economic considerations
- Regulations, Advisory Circulars, etc.

uman Fa





A Few of the Many Issues

Ambiguity of cues / level of certainty about situation

Conflicting warnings / cues

Smoke / Fumes of an unknown origin

Determining / Accessing the proper checklist

Length of time to complete procedures

Initiate descent / diversion and when

What type of descent profile

Checklist wording – how compulsory

Reduced visibility – font size, layout

What memory items

Human Factors research and technology

Timing of source identification vs. smoke removal vs. descent initiation vs. fighting fire High false smoke alarm rate EROPS – nearest airport is far away Ditching while on fire How much troubleshooting Fire in inaccessible places Powering down electrical buses Circuit breaker resetting If / when to declare an emergency with ATC Communicating / coordinating with Cabin crew

A Few of the Many Issues

Ambiguity of cues / level of certainty about situation

Conflicting warnings / cues

Smoke / Fumes of an unknown origin

Determining / Accessing the proper checklist

Length of time to complete procedures

Initiate descent / diversion and when

What type of descent profile

Checklist wording – how compulsory

Reduced visibility - font size, layout

What memory items



Timing of source identification vs. smoke removal vs. descent initiation vs. fighting fire High false smoke alarm rate EROPS – nearest airport is far away Ditching while on fire How much troubleshooting Fire in inaccessible places Powering down electrical buses Circuit breaker resetting If / when to declare an emergency with ATC Communicating / coordinating with Cabin crew

Methods for Accessing the Correct Checklist:

- Gateway Checklist
- Several Separate Checklists
- One Integrated Checklist





Accessing the Correct Checklist: Gateway Checklist

	FIRE & SMOKE	
wa Vige	I. Oxygen Mask & Smoke Goggles (As Required)	N, 100%
	 Crew & Courier Communications EST Check Mike switches set to MASK, place cockpit speaker ON, place MIC SEL switch to INT, and establish crew communication. 	FLT
	 Cockpit Door & Smoke Screen Close the cockpit door & smoke screen to exclude heavy concentrations of smoke. Lee door closed unless opening it is dictated by a greater emergency, and then at Captain's discretion. 	CLOSED ave
	I. If Descent is requiredPROCEED TO	STEP 6
<u> </u>	. If Descent Is NOT RequiredPROCEED TO	STEP 14
	Shouid structural damage be suspected, limit airspeed. Gear and / or Speed Brakes may be used depending on type of damage.	
6	AS RE	QUIRED
7	. Throttles	IDLE
8	. Speed Brake	FULL
9	Airspeed	50 KIAS)
	NOTE If structural damage is known or suspected, use appropriate turbulence penetration speed.	
	0. ATC	NOTIFY
1	1. Transponder (if no contact with ATC)	7700
1	2. Tank Pumps	ALLON
1	3. Altimeter	SET
1	4. Type Of Smoke Or FireDETERMINE & PROCEED TO APPROPRIATE PROCI THIS CH	EDURE, IAPTER
J	A. ELECTRICAL FIRE & SMOKE : Can best be determined by smell or visible smoke electrical components (e.g., circuit breaker, radio)	from
<u> </u>	B. AIRCONDITIONING SMOKE : Can best be recognized by smoke emanating from overhead air conditioning outlets.	
t	CABIN CARGO SMOKE : Can best be recognized by checking smoke detectors on t Second Officers panel, or by observing smoke or fire in the main deck cargo area.	the
	(End of Procedure)	

Accessing the Correct Checklist: Several Separate Checklists



CONTENTS

SMOKE OR FIRE

- Flight Compartment
 Smoke Removal Procedure
- Air-Conditioning Smoke
- Electrical Smoke or Fire
- Cabin Smoke or Fire
- Galley Smoke or Fire
- SMOKE AFT CARGO Msg
- SMOKE FWD CARGO Msg
- SMOKE FWD LAV or SMOKE AFT LAV Msg .

	■ <u>⊨</u> . E
	. E
PAGE	. A
	. S
() BOEING	. L(
767 Operations Manual	N N
Non-Normal Checklists	. G
Fire Protection	. 10
Table of Contents	E P
APU BOTTLE	
APU FIRE	. D
CARGO BOTTLE	. E
CARGO FIRE	. F(
ENGINE BOTTLE	. 0
ENGINE FIRE OR SEVERE DAMAGE OR SEPARATION	
ENGINE OVERHEAT	
FIRE/OVERHEAT SYSTEM	
SMOKE OR FUMES AIR CONDITIONING .	
SMOKE OR FUMES OR FIRE ELECTRICAL	
SMOKE OR FUMES REMOVAL	
WHEEL WELL FIRE	

AIRBUS TRAINING			
A320	A320 EMERGENCY PROCEDURES		1 00
SIMULATOR			1.00
ONTENTS			
■ <u>ELEC</u> . ELEC EME	ER CONFIG-SYS REMAINING		1.01
 FIRE ENG FIRE CAB EQP AIR CONE SMOKE/T 	on ground T SMOKE D SMOKE OXIC FUMES REMOVAL		1.05 1.06 1.06 1.06A
LANDING	<u>) GEAR</u> BRAKING		1.07
 NAVIGAT . GPWS AL . TCAS WA 	<mark>ION</mark> ERTS/EGPWS ALERTS ≪ RNINGS ≪		1.08
• POWER F	P <mark>LANT</mark> L FAILURE		1.10
 MISCELL DITCHING EMER DE FORCED I ON GROU 	ANEOUS SCENT LANDING JND EMER EVACUATION		1.11 1.12 1.13 7.01
T	NNC 8.4		

NNC.8.7
 NNC.8.8
 NNC.8.9
 NNC.8.11
 NNC.8.12
 NNC.8.14

Accessing the Correct Checklist: One Integrated Checklist

SMOKE, CABIN/COCKPIT

■ Oxygen masks and regulatorsOn, 100%
Crew and flight attendant communicationsEstablish
Cabin fans switch Off
Blower switchOverride
Extract switchOverride
Galley/galley and cabin switch Off
Descent Initiate
WARNING: Do not delay descent or diversion to find the smoke source.
Cabin signsOn
CONTINUED FROM ORC

If dense smoke at any time, accomplish reverse side. *REFERENCE ACTION:*

If electrical, cabin, or galley equipment smoke/fire is suspected:

Emergency exit light switchOr	n
If commercial switch installed:	
Commercial switch Of	ff
If commercial switch is not installed:	
Bus tie switch	ff
Generator 2 switch	ff
If smoke persists or just before landing gear extension:	
Generator 2 switch	n
Bus tie switch Aut	0
END	

If air conditioning smoke is suspected:

APU bleed switch Off
Blower switch Auto
Extract switchAuto
Pack 1 switch
If smoke does not decrease:
Pack 1 switch
Pack 2 switch Off
Cargo heat aft isolation valve switch Off
If smoke persists:
Pack 2 switchOn
Blower switchOverride
Extract switchOverride
END
If avionics smoke is suspected:
Accomplish AVIONICS SMOKE ECAM or Flight Manual procedure 14.20.39.

---- END -----

DENSE SMOKE

EMERGENCY DESCENT
■ FCU altitude (safe altitude/10,000 feet)
■ FCU expedite switch Push
■ Target speed Confirm, .80M/340KIAS
Thrust Confirm, idle
Speed brakesExtend
ATC
SMOKE REMOVAL
Pack flow selector
Landing elevation selector
When at safe altitude/10.000 feet:
■ Pack switches 1 + 2 Off
■ Cabin pressure mode selector Manual
Manual vertical speed control switch
When differential pressure is less than 1 PSI:
Ram air switch On
If cockpit smoke requires a cockpit window to be opened:
■ Maximum speed
∎ Headsets On
Cockpit window Open
EMERGENCY ELECTRICAL CONFIGURATION (If Required)
Emergency electrical generator 1 line switch Off
Emergency electrical power switch
When emergency generator available:
APU generator switch Off
Generator 2 switch Off
Before landing gear extension:
Generator 2 switch On
Emergency electrical generator 1 line switch On

Courtesy of Captain Richard Gilbert, UAL

What Drives (or Should Drive) the Design and Content?

Determining / Accessing the Proper Checklist

- Differences in aircraft and equipment design
- Understanding of how different types of fires are ignited, fed, and spread
- Type of operations extended range, passenger vs. cargo
- Assumptions about efficacy of crew response and expectations about amount of time available
- Human factors considerations, Understanding of human performance while under stress
- History of the air carrier, History within the industry
- Philosophies, company policies, and economic considerations
- Regulations, Advisory Circulars, etc.





What Drives (or Should Drive) the Design and Content?

Determining / Accessing the Proper Checklist

- Differences in aircraft and equipment design
- Understanding of how different types of fires are ignited, fed, and spread
- Type of operations extended range, passenger vs. cargo
- Assumptions about efficacy of crew response and expectations about amount of time available
- Human factors considerations, Understanding of human performance while under stress
 - History of the air carrier, History within the industry
 - Philosophies, company policies, and economic considerations
 - Regulations, Advisory Circulars, etc.





Emergency Descent and Diversion Guidance:

Where in the Checklist and How Stated?









Swissair 111 - In-flight Fire Nova Scotia, Canada September 2, 1998

> If smoke/fumes are not eliminated, land at nearest suitable airport

CRJ900	EMER 2-4
Kegional jet	Sep 09/02
Air-Condi	tioning Smoke
The 'Flight Compa Procedure' should during smoke or fir	Intronomic Smoke Removal be used as necessary re conditions.
(1) Oxygen masks/ smoke goggles	DON, SET TO 100%
(2) Crew communication	ESTABLISH
 (3) Flight compartment door (4) NO SMKG and SEAT BL (5) AIR CONDITIONING, AFT CARGO (6) RECIRC FAN (7) Prepare to land immediate Immediate smoke removal rest 	CLOSED TS ON OFF tely at nearest suitable airport. quired:
(8) Descent (9) PRESS CONTROL (10) MAN ALT	to 10,000 feet or lowest safe altitude MAN
(11) MAN RATE	Maximum INCR
(12) MAN ALT	ногр
(12) WANALI	ND -
No	▼

(7) Prepare toland immediatelyat nearestsuitable airport

CRJ 900

AIR COND SMOKE
If electrical smoke from the avionic compartment is suspected, refer to the AVIONICS SMOKE abnormal procedure.
 CREW OXY MASK ON/100 % Use the emergency knob when necessary
– CAB FANS OFF
– APU BLEED OFF
– PACK 1 OFF
if smoke persists :
– PACK 1 ON
– PACK 2 OFF
 SMOKE/TOXIC FUMES REMOVAL PROC (see 1.06A, if necessary) APPLY
<u>NOTE</u> : If cargo ventilation system is installed, it is recommended that the cargo ventilation be closed to prevent a cargo smoke warning from being triggered by smoke coming from the cabin.

R

LDG ELV......10,000 FT/MEA

DESCENT (FL 100 OR MEA)....INITIATE

A320

BEV 27

AIRBUS TRAINING

(C) A320	EMERGENCY PROCEDURES	SEQ 002	1 .06A
SIMULATOR			
S	MOKE/TOXIC FUMES REN	IOVAL	
Use the smoke rea generation cannot If a scent similar fluid (if installed). - CREW OXY Check that the Use the emerge - SEAT BELT - CAB FANS - PACK 1 + 2 - PACK FLOV Do not shut do the fire. Do not - LDG ELEV - DESCENT (PAX oxygen as - ATC • When △P	moval procedure in case of dense smoke or toxi be stopped. to orange peel is smelt in the cockpit, suspect a X MASKS oxygen diluter is at 100 %. mcy knob when necessary. S/NO SMOKING 2 (if fuel vapors) X (if no fuel vapors) wn air cond. packs and do not reduce ventilatio t deploy pax oxygen masks if fire is suspected in FL 100 OR MEA) required by regulation.	c fumes (smell) n toxic leak of r O n in an attempt in the cabin. 10 000	or if smoke ain repellent N/100 % ON OFF OFF HI t to smother FT/MEA INITIATE NOTIFY
	1 - 51 OF DEIOW :		ON
 if cockpit of – MAX SP – HEADSE – COCKPIT – CAUTIC Due to ince 	window opening required : D TS T WINDOW PN reased noise level pay particular attent	ion to visual	. 200 KT ON OPEN warnings

DEFING Non-Normal Checklists Fire Protectio 767 Operations Manual
SMOKE OR FUMES AIR CONDITIONING
Condition: A concentration of air conditioning smoke or fumes is identified.
OXYGEN MASKS AND SMOKE GOGGLES (If required)ON
CREW COMMUNICATIONS (If required) ESTABLISH
RECIRCULATION FAN SWITCHES (Both) OFF [Removes fans as a possible source of smoke or fumes. Stops recirculation of smoke or fumes and increases fresh air flow.]
GASPER FAN SWITCHOFF
APU BLEED AIR SWITCHOFF [Removes APU, if running, as a possible source of smoke or fumes.]
If smoke or fumes continues:
LEFT AND RIGHT ISOLATION SWITCHESOFF [Isolates left and right sides of the bleed air system.]
RIGHT PACK CONTROL SELECTOR OFF [Removes right side of the air conditioning system as a possible source of smoke or fumes.]
If smoke or fumes continue:
RIGHT PACK CONTROL SELECTOR AUTO [Restores right side of the air conditioning system.]
LEFT PACK CONTROL SELECTOROFF [Removes left side of the air conditioning system as a possible source of smoke or fumes.]
If smoke or fumes are persistent:
Plan to land at the nearest suitable airport.
Do not accomplish the following checklists: PACK OFF RECIRCULATION FAN

B767-400

If smoke or fumes are persistent:

Plan to land at the nearest suitable airport.

Emergency Descent and Diversion Guidance Summary: Air Conditioning Smoke

(A Somewhat Unfair Comparison)

Aircraft Type	Number of Checklists*	Location	Wording
MD-11	2	Last item, 2 nd checklist	If smoke/fumes not eliminated, land at nearest suitable airport
CRJ-900	1	Middle of checklist (step 7)	Prepare to land immediately at nearest suitable airport.
A320	2	Nowhere	N/A
B767-400	1	Next to the last item	If smoke or fumes are persistent: Plan to land at the nearest suitable airport.



* to get to descent / diversion guidance



Emergency Descent and Diversion Guidance Summary: Electrical Smoke / Fire

Aircraft Type	Number of Checklists*	Location	Wording
CRJ-900	1	First third of checklist (step 6)	Prepare to land immediately at nearest suitable airport.
A320	-	There is no electrical smoke or fire checklist	N/A
	1	Avionics Smoke has items for electrical smoke – 1 st item	LAND ASAP
B767-400	1	Last item on the checklist	If smoke or fumes or fire persists or source is unknown: Plan to land at the nearest suitable airport.



* to get to descent / diversion guidance



Emergency Descent and Diversion

In a study of 15 in-flight fires that occurred between January 1967 and September 1998, the TSB of Canada determined that the average amount of time between the detection of an on-board fire and when the aircraft ditched, conducted a forced landing, or crashed was 17 minutes.





False Cargo Smoke Alarms, 1974 - 1999



Cost of Diversions: fuel, passenger ill-will, operational considerations, aircraft and crew scheduling, possible evacuation injuries, etc.





What Drives (or Should Drive) the Design and Content?

Descent and Diversion Guidance – Location and Wording

- Differences in aircraft and equipment design
- Understanding of how different types of fires are ignited, fed, and spread
- Type of operations extended range, passenger vs. cargo
- Assumptions about efficacy of crew response and expectations about amount of time available
- Human factors considerations, Understanding of human performance while under stress
- History of the air carrier, History within the industry
- Philosophies, company policies, and economic considerations
- Regulations, Advisory Circulars, etc.







What Drives (or Should Drive) the Design and Content?

Descent and Diversion Guidance – Location and Wording

- Differences in aircraft and equipment design
- Understanding of how different types of fires are ignited, fed, and spread
- Type of operations extended range, passenger vs. cargo
- Assumptions about efficacy of crew response and expectations about amount of time available
- Human factors considerations, Understanding of human performance while under stress
 - History of the air carrier, History within the industry
 - Philosophies, company policies, and economic considerations



• Regulations, Advisory Circulars, etc. (AC 120-80: "...flight crew members should begin planning for an emergency landing as soon as possible after the first indication of fire" pg 6.)



Immanuel Barshi, Ph.D.** Sean Belcher, M.A.** Ben Berman, A.B.** Barbara Burian, Ph.D.* Key Dismukes, Ph.D.** Richard Fariello, B.S.** Colleen Geven, A.A.** Richard Geven, M.A.** Jon Holbrook, Ph.D. Jessica Lang Nowinski, Ph.D. Sharon Pickering, M.S.

> * Certificated Pilot ** ATP Certificate





Barbara Burian, Ph.D. bburian@mail.arc.nasa.gov

Emergency and Abnormal Situations Project http://human-factors.arc.nasa.gov/eas



